

EXHIBIT L



U.S. Department of Justice

*United States Attorney
Southern District of New York*

*86 Chambers Street, 3rd Floor
New York, New York 10007*

January 25, 2008

By Certified Mail

Thomas Cmar
Natural Resources Defense Council
1200 New York Ave., Suite 400
Washington, DC 20005

Re: Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc. v. U.S. Dep't of State,
No. 07 Civ. 5929 (WHP)

Dear Mr. Cmar:


Enclosed please find the Vaughn Indexes for redactions and withheld documents that NRDC has indicated it is interested in challenging for both the 2006 and 2007 FOIA requests submitted by NRDC. By producing these Vaughn Indexes, the Government is not waiving any privilege that, upon further review, may be found to apply.

Please note that in course of reviewing the documents, we have determined that additional material responsive to NRDC's requests is capable of being released and will be sent to your attention under separate cover. The enclosed indexes incorporate these revised redactions.

Sincerely,

MICHAEL J. GARCIA
United States Attorney

By:


REBECCA C. MARTIN
Assistant United States Attorney
Telephone: (212) 637-2714
Facsimile: (212) 637-2686

Enclosures

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2006 FOIA REQUEST

<u>Entry No.</u>	<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Description/Title</u>	<u>Withholding</u>	<u>Exempt'n</u>	<u>Justification</u>
1	05	Undated. 2 pages. Handwritten notes of discussion involving officials from Office of the US Trade Representative ("USTR"), State Department Bureau of Oceans and International Environmental and Scientific Affairs ("OES"), and Forest and Wildlife Service ("FWS"), concerning 13th Conference of the Parties, Oct. 2-14, 2004, and issues concerning illegal logging of mahogany.	Denied in full.	B5	These handwritten notes reflect predecisional deliberations, questions, and the suggestions and opinions of the writer and other conversation participants as well as the give and take of a consultative process.
2	06	June 21, 2004. 3 pages. Handwritten notes of meeting concerning issues and strategies for addressing illegal logging of mahogany.	Denied in full.	B5	These handwritten notes discuss questions, desired outcomes, and other predecisional and deliberative material.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2006 FOIA REQUEST

3	O15	December 3-9, 2003. 3 pages. Email chain among officials from OES, and US Embassy regarding regional collaboration efforts and CITES training for sustainable use of big-leaf mahogany in Central and South America as well as funding for the same.	Partial redaction. Discussion regarding coordination and funding of proposed workshops and personal email address.	B5, B6	redacted discussions are predecisional and reflect the suggestions and opinions of the writer and the give and take of a consultative process. Redacted email account withheld on privacy grounds.
4	O16	December 11, 2003. 2 pages. Email among officials from OES, Forest and Wildlife Service ("FWS"), and USDA of Forest Service ("USDA"), regarding ITTO Yokohama conference guidance for a conference in Lima.	Partial redaction. Personal email account and projections concerning planning, substance, and coordination of a proposed workshop.	B5, B6	Redacted discussions are predecisional and reflect the suggestions and opinions of the writer and the give and take of a consultative process. Redactions also contain the address of a Yahoo email account, which is withheld on privacy grounds.
5	O18	May 1 - June 12, 2006. 4 pages. Multiple emails among officials from US Embassy, OES, Western Hemisphere Affairs ("WHA"), State Department Office of Legal Advisor ("L"), and to a now-defunct State Department email address, concerning NRDG lawsuit concerning logging.	Denied in full.	B5	This document is predecisional and contains discussion and reflects consultative give and take concerning strategies for responding to issues arising from NRDG lawsuit concerning logging and includes advice from State Department attorney on related issues.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2006 FOIA REQUEST

6	019	May 12, 2006. 3 pages. "Working Draft" of a paper concerning proposed workshop on increasing transparency in the forest sector in the Amazon Basin. (Portion of an email appears to have been erroneously copied into document.)	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning proposed goals and strategies for curbing illegal logging. The partial page of an erroneously inserted email appears to be an email among State Department officials seeking status update on a pending congressional report.
7	020	Project proposal entitled "OESI FY 2005 FLEG Implementation Proposal" concerning the President's Initiative Against Illegal Logging ("PIAL") and Forest Law Enforcement and Governance ("FLEG) regional processes concerning illegal logging. 3 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	The document is predecisional and reflects the writer's recommendation of certain projects to advance implementation of the PIAL/FLEG program.
8	024	Draft summary of January 12-14 workshop on Industry Contribution to Forest Governance (Year unknown). 21 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	This draft document is predecisional and reflects the views and opinions of the writer, including draft commentary, proposed edits, and incomplete sections.
9	032	Proposal regarding funding for the President's Initiative Against Illegal Logging (PIAL). 2 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and reflects the writer's recommendation for funding requests and distributions. As such, it is a predecisional, deliberative document created for the purpose of arriving at a future agency decision.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2006 FOIA REQUEST

10	O34	September 5, 2006. 2 pages. Meorandum to the President from Condoleeza Rice, concerning progress and outlook report on PIALL.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is a presidential communication.
11	O43	June 15, 2004. 2 pages. Email chain among officials from US Embassy, OES, USTR, WHA, and FWS, regarding updated information concerning Peru's proposal for ITTO assistance on mahogany management and Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora ("CITES") Appendix II permits.	Partial redaction. The first, second, third and fifth redactions concern deliberations regarding Peruvian proposals and goals for the remainder of 2004. Fourth redaction concerns sensitive details of performance assessments and activities.	B5, B6	The first, second, third and fifth redactions concern discussions which are predecisional and reflect the suggestions and opinions of the writer and the give and take of a consultative process. The fourth redaction contains concerns information whose release would risk personal harassment and invasion of privacy of a foreign individual.
12	O44	June 9, 2004. 2 pages. Email chain among officials from OES, US Embassy, USTR, and FWS, concerning proposed project concerning illegal logging.	Denied in full.	B5	This document is predecisional and reflects the opinions and recommendations of writers concerning options for a follow-up project to a 2004 workshop and reflects the give and take of the consultative process.
13	O44A	Attachment to Doc. No. 044, June 9, 2004 Email chain. 1 page.	Denied in full.	B5	This attachment proposes a schedule and budget for the contemplated project discussed in the June 9, 2004 Email chain. This proposal is a predecisional, deliberative document.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2006 FOIA REQUEST

14	O44B	Attachment to Doc. No. 044, June 9, 2004 Email chain. 2 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	This attachment proposes a statement of goals, responsibilities and objectives of the contemplated project discussed in the June 9, 2004 Email chain. This proposal is a predecisional, deliberative document.
15	O47	January 13-15, 2004. 4 pages. Email chain involving officials from OES, L, State Department Office of Public Affairs ("PA"), and US Embassy. Subject line: "Peruvian mahogany exports."	Denied in full.	B1, B5	Document contains sensitive information concerning the activities of a foreign government the release of which reasonably could be expected to harm foreign relations (classified under EO 12958 1.4(d)); document also includes confidential deliberations involving State Department officials and State Department attorney about the CITES treaty.
16	O48	January 13-14, 2004. 4 pages. Email chain involving officials from OES, L, PA, and US Embassy. Subject line: "Peruvian mahogany exports."	Denied in full.	B1, B5	Identical to document O47 except for the top email, which seeks advice from a State Department attorney on CITES issues.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2006 FOIA REQUEST

17	049	August 24-31, 2006. 3 pages. Email chain among officials from US Embassy, OES, USTR, L and USTR counsel's office, concerning possible issues and talking points for US Embassy representative for upcoming Peruvian workshop on Peruvian mahogany and NRDC lawsuit concerning same.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and reflects the opinions and recommendations of the writers of the emails and shows the give and take of the consultative process. Document also contains recommendation from counsel as to how to proceed with respect to various issues.
18	052	September 18, 2006. 3 pages. Email chain among officials from OES, US Embassy, and FWS, concerning possible issues and talking points for US Embassy representative for upcoming Peruvian workshop on Peruvian mahogany and NRDC lawsuit concerning same.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and reflects the opinions and recommendations of the writers of the emails and shows the give and take of the consultative process. Document also contains recommendation from counsel as to how to proceed with respect to various issues.
19	054A	Draft of position paper discussing agenda and U.S. position concerning inclusion of mahogany in the Significant Trade Review process for 16th meeting of the Plants Committee, July 3-8, 2006. 7 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the position to be taken by US government concerning whether to include mahogany in the Significant Trade Review process.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2006 FOIA REQUEST

20	O60	December 16, 2003. 2 pages. Email among officials from USTR, USDA, FWS, International Trade Administration ("ITA") and OES, regarding meeting to discuss plans for an ITTO-sponsored regional workshop on mahogany trade and CITES and written notes from that meeting.	Partial redaction. The redacted material consists of personal, handwritten notes from the meeting, which contain deliberative, predecisional information.	B5	The redacted information is predecisional and reflects the suggestions and opinions of the writer and other meeting participants as well as the give and take of a consultative process.
21	O62	Proposal regarding project for promoting sustainable mahogany forest management in the Amazon Basin. 3 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning possible initiatives to be undertaken by the USG concerning forestry management issues in Peru.
22	O62A	Proposed schedule and budget for project recommended in O62. 1 page.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions by decision-makers.
23	O62C	Proposed "Statement of Work" for project recommended in O62. 2 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions by decision-makers.
24	O63	Redlined draft of Instructions for the U.S. Delegation to the Regional Workshop on Capacity Building for Mahogany, May 2004. 7 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning proposed goals and strategy for U.S. delegates.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2006 FOIA REQUEST

25	O64	Redlined draft, with handwritten edits and notes, of instructions for the U.S. Delegation to the Regional Workshop on Capacity Building for Mahogany, May 2004. 8 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning proposed goals and strategy for U.S. delegates.
26	O65A	Redlined draft of Instructions for the U.S. Delegation to the Regional Workshop on Capacity Building for Mahogany, May 2004. 7 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning proposed goals and strategy for U.S. delegates.
27	E8	Apr. 6, 2006. 7 pages. Cable from US Embassy in Lima to US Secretary of State concerning illegal logging in the Peruvian forest sector.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Page 2. Partial redaction. Numbered Para 1 (sentence 4). Discussion of US Embassy opinion on INRENA activities.- Page 4. Partial redaction. Numbered Para 10 (sentences 2 and 4). Discussion of US Embassy opinion as to GOP computerized system for tracking mahogany harvest.-Page 4. Partial redaction. Numbered Para 11 (sentences 3-5). Discussion of US Embassy opinion as to GOP handling of illegal logging and issues that could arise in advance of an upcoming CITES meeting to be held in Peru.		Document contains opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2006 FOIA REQUEST

28	E13	November 20, 2003. Cable from US Embassy in Lima to Washington DC headquarters of four US government agencies. 3 pages. Subject: "Peru: Dimarche on CITES Appendix II requirements for mahogany."	Released in part. Two redactions, totaling approximately 6 lines of text on page 2, containing information received from and about Peruvian government officials.	B1. Originally marked unclassified, this material was subsequently classified in accordance with EO 12958 section 1.7(d).	Unauthorized release of foreign government information given to the US government with a diplomatic expectation of confidentiality, and internal communications about foreign officials, reasonably could be expected to cause harm to our relations with the foreign government. The redacted information is therefore currently and properly classified under EO 12958, as amended, sections 1.4(b) and (d). conform classification basis
29	E14	December 3, 2003. Cable from US Embassy in Lima to Washington DC headquarters of five US government agencies. Subject: "Peru faces critical problems in meeting CITES mahogany requirements, controlling illegal logging."	Released in part. Redacted material concerns the activities of logging companies in Peru, operations of a Peruvian agency, and corruption allegations.	B1	Unauthorized release of foreign government information given to the US government with a diplomatic expectation of confidentiality, and sensitive aspects of foreign government activities, reasonably could be expected to cause harm to our relations with the foreign government. The redacted information is therefore currently and properly classified under EO 12958, as amended, sections 1.4(b) and (d).

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

<u>Entry No.</u>	<u>Doc. No.</u>	<u>Description/Title</u>	<u>Withholding</u>	<u>Exempt'n</u>	<u>Justification</u>
1	O10	Jan. 24, 2007. 3 pages. Email among officials from the State Department Bureau of Oceans and International Environmental and Scientific Affairs ("OES"), Environment and Natural Resources Management of USAID ("ENR"), US Embassy, Economic Growth and Trade office of USAID ("EGT") concerning upcoming meetings for Assistant Secretary Claudia McMurray ("A/S") in Lima, Peru concerning various wildlife issue, including the logging of mahogany.	- Pages 1-2. 4 emails dated Jan. 24, 2007 among officials from OES, ENR, US Embassy, and EGT. Denied full text of these emails. Discussion of strategy and logistics for meetings with Peru's National Institute for Natural Resources ("INRENA") regarding logging of mahogany and other environmental issues; discussion of strategy for responding to Congressional concerns about Free Trade Agreement ("FTA") with Peru and illegal logging.	B5	redacted discussions are predecisional and reflect the suggestions and opinions of the writer and the give and take of a consultative process.
2	O12	Jan. 24, 2007. 1 page. Email among officials from OES.	Page 1. Partial redaction. Para 2 (sentence 3). Discussion of possible issues to be raised by A/S with Peruvian officials during upcoming trip to Peru.	B5	redacted discussions are predecisional and reflect the suggestions and opinions of the writer of the email and the give and take of a consultative process.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

3

012A

January 17, 2007. 2 pages.
Letter from eleven

This is attachment was uncovered recently and is
undergoing interagency review.

Congressional Representatives
(Jim McDermott, Lloyd Doggett,
Pete Stark, John Lewis, Xavier
Becerra, Mike Thompson, Earl
Blumenauer, Bill Pascrell, Chris
Van Hollen Allison Schwartz,
and John Larson) to Susan
Schwab, U.S. Trade
Representative, concerning
environmental protection
issues and negotiation of
bilateral trade agreements.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

4	O15	Feb. 2-13, 2007. 3 pages. Multiple emails among officials from OES and US Embassy, concerning possible A/S trip to Latin America.	- Page 1, Three emails dated Feb. 8 and 13, 2007. Denied full text of these emails. Discussions about a planned trip to Latin America by A/S, including discussion of logistics, schedules, topics to be addressed, tasks to be coordinated in advance. - Page 2, Email dated Feb. 8, 2007. Partial redaction. Para 1, (sentence 3). Discussion of possible topics to include in speech before Humane Society International ("HSI"). - Page 2. Email dated February 9, 2007. Denied full text of email. Discussion of logistics, schedules, topics to be addressed, tasks to be coordinated in advance of meeting. Page 3. Email dated February 2, 2007. Partial redaction. Discussion of possible topics to be addressed during trip and tasks to be coordinated in advance of trip.	B5	redacted discussions are predessional and reflect the suggestions and opinions of the writer of the email
5	O17	Feb. 15, 2007. 1 page. Email among OES officials discussing upcoming A/S trip to Peru.	Denied in full. Discussion of possible topics to be addressed during A/S trip to Peru and tasks to be coordinated in advance of trip.	B5	redacted discussions are predessional and reflect the suggestions and opinions of writer of email and the give and take of a consultative process.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

6	O20	Feb. 15, 2007. 2 pages. Multiple emails among officials from OES, ENR, EGT and US Embassy, concerning A/S trip to Peru.	- Page 1-2. Partial Redaction. Redacted text of entire document <u>except for first email, dated February 15, 2007 from Mary Gorfance.</u> Also redacted "Re" line of email. Redacted portion of document contains (1) discussion of strategy and topics for A/S to address in meetings with Peruvian officials and tasks to be coordinated in advance of meetings and (2) personal email address and cell phone number.	B5 B6	redacted discussions are predecisional and reflect the suggestions/opinions of writers of email and show the give and take of a consultative process. Personal information is withheld on privacy grounds.
7	O22	Feb. 15-16, 2007. 3 pages. Multiple emails among officials from OES, US Embassy, ENR, and EGT concerning upcoming A/S trip to Peru.	Page 1-3. Partial Redaction. Redacted all text, <u>except for first sentence of February 16, 2007 email.</u> Redacted portion of document contains (1) discussion of strategy for A/S meetings, various concerns about issues expected to be addressed during trip, and tasks to be coordinated in advance of trip and (2) personal email address and cellphone numebers.	B5 B6	redacted discussions are predecisional and reflect the suggestions/opinions of the writers of emails and show the give and take of a consultative process. Personal information is withheld on privacy grounds.
8	O24A	Redlined draft of speech to be given by A/S at the Humane Society International Conference on Whale and Dolphin Watching in Peru in February 2007. 14 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and does not contain the final wording of the speech; document reflects recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the topics and wording of the speech and the strategies for raising and addressing numerous environmental issues, including illegal logging.

9	O25	Feb. 16, 2007. 1 page. Multiple emails among officials from OES, ENR, US Embassy, Western Hemisphere Affairs ("WHA"), and National Oceanic and Atmospheric Admin. ("NOAA"), concerning draft of speech referenced in O24A.	- Page 1. Partial Redaction. Redacted all text, except for earliest email, from Russell Newell to OES officials. Remainder of document consists of comments on draft of speech for A/S, referenced in O24.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the topics and wording of the speech and the strategies for raising and addressing numerous environmental issues, including illegal logging.
10	O27A	Redlined draft of speech referenced in O24A. 14 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and does not contain the final wording of the speech; document reflects recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the topics and wording of the speech and the strategies for raising and addressing numerous environmental issues, including illegal logging.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

11	O28	Feb. 16-20, 2007. 2 pages. Multiple emails among officials from OES, ENR, US Embassy, WHA, and NOAA, concerning draft of speech referenced in O24A.	- Page 1-2. Partial Redaction. Redacted all text, except for earliest email, from Russell Newell to OES officials. Redacted portion of document consists of comments on draft of speech for A/S, referenced in O24A.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the topics and wording of the speech and the strategies for raising and addressing numerous environmental issues, including illegal logging.
12	O28A	Redlined draft of speech referenced in O24A. 14 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and does not contain the final wording of the speech; document reflects recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the topics and wording of the speech and the strategies for raising and addressing numerous environmental issues, including illegal logging.
13	O31	Feb. 16 and 21, 2007. 3 pages. Email chain among officials from OES, US Embassy concerning illegal logging of mahogany.	- Page 1. Feb. 21, 2007 email. Partial redaction. Para 2; Feb. 16, 2007 email. Partial redaction. Para 1 (sentence 1, 3-6). Discussions about implications of and strategy with respect to Peru's announcement of its 2007 mahogany quota.	B5	redacted discussions are predecisional and reflect the suggestions/opinions of writers of email and show the give and take of a consultative process.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

14	O32B	Draft of summary of issues and talking points concerning illegal logging of bigleaf mahogany in Peru. 2 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and does not contain the final position to be taken; document reflects recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning issues concerning illegal logging.
15	O33	Feb. 21, 2007. 1 page. Email from between OES officials, forwarding draft of issue paper referenced below as O33A.	Upon further review, State Department has agreed to release in full.		
16	O33A	Draft of summary of issues and talking points concerning illegal logging of bigleaf mahogany in Peru. 2 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and does not contain the final position to be taken; document reflects recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning issues related to illegal logging.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

17	035	Feb. 20-22, 2007. 3 pages. Multiple emails among officials from OES, US Embassy, and WHA, concerning draft of Issue Paper on mahogany.	- Page 1. Email dated February 22, 2007. Partial redaction. Para 1. Discussion of earlier draft of speech and discussing strategy for workshop at which Deputy Assistant Secretary ("DAS"), David Balton, would be speaking. - Page 2. Email dated Feb. 20, 2007. Partial redaction. Para 1-2. Discussion of strategy for workshop at which DAS would be speaking.	B5	Document is predecisional and reflects the suggestions/opinions of the writers of the emails and show the give and take of a consultative process.
18	036	Feb. 20-28, 2007. 3 pages. Multiple emails among officials from OES, WHA, US Embassy, concerning draft of Issue Paper on logging of mahogany.	- Page 1. Email dated February 21, 2007. Partial redaction. Para 1. Discussion of earlier draft of speech and discussing strategy for DAS meeting. - Page 2. Email dated Feb. 20, 2007. Partial redaction. Para 1-2. Discussion of strategy for workshop at which DAS would be speaking.	B5	Document is predecisional and reflects the suggestions/opinions of writers of email and show the give and take of a consultative process.
19	040	March 28, 2007. 1 page. Multiple emails among officials from OES and State Department Office of Legal Advisor ("L").	Denied in full. Discussion of strategy for responding to cable sent from US Embassy on illegal logging of mahogany.	B5	Document is predecisional and reflects the suggestions/opinions of writers of email and show the give and take of a consultative process.
20	044	April 9, 2007. 2 pages. Email among OES officials, forwarding March 27, 2007 email attaching documents from INRENA website.	- Page 1. Partial redaction. Para 2(sentence 3-5). Discussion of possible US response to INRENA's determination of Peru's export quota. - Attachments to email have not been uncovered; State Department is seeking to obtain and review copies of attachments.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning illegal logging issues.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

21	O45	April 9-10, 2007. 1 page. Email among officials from OES, and Fish and Wildlife Service ("FWS"), concerning CITES timber issues.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains discussion of tasks to be coordinated.
22	O50	May 15, 2007. 2 pages. Multiple emails among officials from OES and L, concerning 4 Free Trade Agreements ("FTA").	- Page 1. Partial redaction. Email dated May 15, 2007 among officials from L and OES, concerning strategy and substance of response to proposed language for a Free Trade Agreement ("FTA") with Peru concerning illegal logging of mahogany. - Page 2. Partial redaction. Para 3 (sentence 1) discussing tasks to be coordinated with respect to response to proposed language for Peru FTA.	B5	Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning illegal logging issues
23	O53	May 21-22, 2007. 1 page (pages are missing). Multiple emails among officials from OES, US Trade Representative "USTR", FWS, and L, concerning draft of USTR document on bigleaf mahogany.	Denied in full. Discussion about draft document and providing comments on same.	B5	Document is predecisional and reflects the suggestions/opinions of writers of email and show the give and take of a consultative process.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

24

O53A

Denied in full.

redlined draft of USTR position paper discussing certain aspects of Document SC55 Doc. 12, prepared by Secretariat for Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora ("CITES"), on the logging of bigleaf mahogany in Peru and setting forth (1) recommendations for the U.S. government ("USG") agenda for the 55th meeting of the Standing Committee of CITES and (2) recommendations for USG position on the CITES Secretariat's recommendations concerning mahogany. 9 pages.

B5

Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the position to be taken by USG concerning CITES recommendations on logging of mahogany.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

25	054	May 23, 2007. 3 pages. Multiple emails among officials from OES, I, USTR, ENRD, FWS, EGT, USDA of the Forest Service ("USDA"), Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), International Trade Administration ("ITA"), Forest Service ("FS"), White House Council on Environment ("CEQ"), Dep't of Interior ("DOI"), National Security Council ("NSC"), National Security Council ("NSC"), and Department of Homeland Security ("DHS"), concerning meeting on Perus's forest sector. Pages missing.	Denied in full. Discussion of logistics and topics for interagency meeting on Perus' forest sector.	B5	Document is predecisional and reveals deliberations by and concerns of decision-makers
26	057	Email transmitting mahogany files	Upon further review, the State Department has agreed to release in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and reveals deliberations by and concerns of decision-makers
27	057A	Cable from US Embassy.	Upon further review, the State Department has determined this document to be a duplicate of E8, produced in the 2006 FOIA production.	B5	Document is predecisional and reveals deliberations by and concerns of decision-makers
28	059	May 29, 2007. 1 page. Multiple emails forwarding draft paper prepared by FWS on mahogany.	Previously determined to be non-responsive. Document is currently under review.	B5	Document is predecisional and reveals deliberations by and concerns of decision-makers

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

29	059A	Draft of document prepared by FWS, captioned "Draft Tentative Negotiating Position Paper" and entitled "Bigleaf Mahogany: Report of the working group," concerning US government negotiating position and strategy in the context of upcoming meeting of the Bigleaf Mahogany Working Group, formed by the CITES Plant Committee. 4 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document is predecisional and does not contain the final position to be taken; document reflects recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning US position and strategies with respect to bigleaf mahogany.
30	060	May 29, 2007. 4 pages. Cable from US Embassy in Lima to US Secretary of State concerning CITES, Cedar and Mahogany in Peru.	- Page 1. Partial redaction. Para 1 (sentence 7). - Recommending potential action with respect to Peruvian cedar. - Page 3. Partial redaction. Numbered Para 14. Discussion of strategies for encouraging forestry conservation and sustainable development for residents of Peruvian forests.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning possible initiatives to be undertaken by the USG concerning forestry and development issues in Peru.
31	061	May 30, 2007. 6 pages. Email among officials from ENR, USTR, EGT, US Embassy, concerning a draft list of reference materials.	Denied in full. Discussion of draft list of references to be used for assessing governance of Peruvian forest sector; discussion of logistics for interagency meeting concerning same; personal email address.	B5 B6	Document is predecisional and reflects recommendations and opinions and shows the give and take of the consultative process. Personal information withheld on privacy ground.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

32	O61A-H	Attachments to Document O61. Documents were inadvertently omitted from review and are currently under review.	B5	Document is predecisional and reflects
33	O63	June 1, 2007. 1 page. Multiple emails among officials from ENR, ITA, USDA, USTR, EPA, EGT, FS, CEO, ENRD, DOI, OES, FWS, NSC, L, US Embassy, and DHS concerning a draft list of reference materials.	B6	recommendations and opinions and shows the give and take of the consultative process. Personal information withheld on privacy grounds.
34	O65	May 31 - June 1, 2007. 2 pages. Multiple emails among officials from DOI, USTR, ITA, USDA, DHS, EPA, EGT, FS, ENR, CEO, ENRD, OES, FWS, NSC, L, US Embassy, concerning USTR assessment of Peru forestry governance.	B5	Document is predecisional and reflects recommendations and opinions and and shows the give and take of the consultative process.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

35	O66	Denied in full.	B5
	Draft of USTR position paper discussing certain aspects of Document SC55 Doc. 12, prepared by Secretariat for Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora ("CITES"), on the logging of bigleaf mahogany in Peru and setting forth (1) recommendations for the U.S. government ("USG") agenda for the 55th meeting of the Standing Committee of CITES and (2) recommendations for USG position on the CITES Secretariat's recommendations concerning mahogany.		Document is predecisional and contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the position to be taken by USG concerning CITES recommendations on logging of mahogany.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

36	O66	Draft of USTR position paper discussing certain aspects of Document SC55 Doc. 12, prepared by CITES Secretariat on the logging of bigleaf mahogany in Peru and setting forth (1) recommendations for USG agenda for the 55th meeting of the Standing Committee of CITES and (2) recommendations for USG position on the CITES Secretariat's recommendations concerning mahogany. 9 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the position to be taken by USG concerning CITES recommendations on logging of mahogany.
37	O69A	Redlined draft document of issues concerning the Peru FTA and Peruvian mahogany in "Q and A" format. 3 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the topics and wording of responses to questions concerning Peruvian mahogany and illegal logging.
38	O71	June 7, 2007. 2 pages. Multiple emails among officials from Economic Bureau ("EB") and OES, concerning draft Q and A about FTAs, to be posted on USTR website.	Denied in full. Discussion of comments on draft Q and A document concerning FTAs and discussion of logistics concerning same.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the topics and wording of issues concerning FTAs.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

39	072A	Redlined draft document of issues concerning the Peru FTA and Peruvian mahogany in "Q and A" format. 3 pages.	Denied in full.	B5
40	073	June 7, 2007. 1 page. Multiple emails among officials from OES, providing comments on the draft document of issues concerning the Peru FTA and Peruvian mahogany in "Q and A" format.	Denied in full.	B5
41	074	June 7, 2007. 1 page. Multiple emails among officials from OES, EB and L, providing comments on the draft document referenced in 074A.	Denied in full.	B5

Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the topics and wording of responses to questions concerning Peruvian mahogany and illegal logging.

Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of responses to questions concerning Peruvian mahogany and illegal logging.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

42	074A	Redlined draft document of issues concerning the Peru FTA and Peruvian mahogany in "Q and A" format. 3 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of responses to questions concerning Peruvian mahogany and illegal logging.
43	077	June 7, 2007. 2 pages. Multiple emails among officials from L and OES, concerning draft Q and A about FTAs, to be posted on USTR website.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of responses to questions concerning Peruvian mahogany and illegal logging.
44	078A	Redlined draft document of issues concerning the Peru FTA and Peruvian mahogany in "Q and A" format. 3 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of responses to questions concerning Peruvian mahogany and illegal logging.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

45	079	June 7, 2007. 2 page. Multiple emails among officials from OES, EB and L, providing comments on the draft document referenced in 079A.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of responses to questions concerning Peruvian mahogany and illegal logging.
46	079A	Redlined draft document of issues concerning the Peru FTA and Peruvian mahogany in "Q and A" format. 3 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of responses to questions concerning Peruvian mahogany and illegal logging.
47	083	June 18, 2007. 5 pages. Email among officials from OES, EGT and USAID, forwarding attached Cable No. 02099 from US Embassy in Peru.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Page 2. Partial redaction. Numbered Para 1 (sentence 4). Discussion of development of interagency strategy for assisting Peruvian forestry sector and specific recommendations for components of such strategy.- Page 3-4. Partial redaction. Numbered Para 6 (all). Discussion of strategy for harmonizing interagency efforts to assist Peruvian forestry sector.- Page 5. Partial redaction. Numbered Para 7. (sentence 5). Expression of opinion about potential advantages of the proposed "joint platform of work" (referred to in sentence 4 of Numbered para 7).	B5	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Redactions contain recommendations and opinions of writer and not a final decision of the agency and, further, reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning strategies for responding to Peruvian environmental issues, including logging.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

48	O84	June 18, 2007. 1 page. Multiple emails among officials from OES, L, and Trade Policy and Programs ("TPP"), and Office of Deputy of Secretary of State ("D"), concerning clearance for Bipartisan Trade Agreement texts.	Denied in full. Discussion of tasks to be coordinated for clearance of "Bipartisan Trade Agreement-FTA Text."	B5	Document contains discussions that are predecisional and reflect the suggestions and opinions of writer of email and the give and take of a consultative process.
49	O84A	Redlined draft of Article 18 of FTA text, concerning environmental matters. 16 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of FTA text concerning environmental issues.
50	O85	June 18, 2007. 1 page. Email among OES and L officials.	Denied in full. Comments on draft of FTA Annex on Peru Forest Sector Governance.	B5	Document contains discussions that are predecisional and reflect the suggestions and opinions of writer of email and the give and take of a consultative process.
51	O87A	Redlined draft of document, in Q and A format, concerning the FTA Annex on Peru Forest Sector Governance. 5 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of text.

VAUGHN INDEX FOR 2007 FOIA REQUEST

52	089A	Redlined draft of document, in Q and A format, concerning the FTA Annex on Peru Forest Sector Governance. 5 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of text.
53	093	June 27, 2007. 6 pages. Email among USTR, OES and EB officials concerning draft of document, in Q and A format, concerning the FTA Annex on Peru Forest Sector Governance.	Denied in full. Discussion of revisions to be made to referenced Q and A document.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of text.
54	094A	Redlined draft of document, in Q and A format, concerning the FTA Annex on Peru Forest Sector Governance. 5 pages.	Denied in full.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of text.
55	097	June 27, 2007. 6 pages. Email among officials from USTR, EB, and OES, concerning draft of document, in Q and A format, concerning the FTA Annex on Peru Forest Sector Governance.	Denied in full. Discussion of revisions to be made to referenced Q and A document and of strategy concerning upcoming briefing concerning FTA environmental issues, including Peruvian forest governance.	B5	Document contains recommendations and opinions and reveals deliberations by decision-makers concerning the wording of text.